Summary Minutes of the

U.S. Department of Energy (DOE)

Commission to Review the Effectiveness of the National Energy Laboratories Public Meeting

Commission Members TJ Glauthier, Co-Chair; Jared Cohon, Co-Chair; Cherry Murray; Wanda Austin;

<u>in Attendance</u>: Paul Fleury; Susan Hockfield;

<u>Date and Time</u>: 1:00 PM – 2:00 PM, Friday, October 23, 2015

<u>Location</u>: Teleconference

<u>Purpose</u>: Meeting of the Commission to Review the Effectiveness of the DOE National

Energy Laboratories

<u>DOE Staff</u>: Karen Gibson, Designated Federal Officer; Matt Schaub, Deputy Designated

Federal Officer

<u>IDA and STPI Staff</u>: Mark Taylor, Susannah Howieson, Martha Merrill

Meeting Summary

The Commission to Review the Effectiveness of the National Energy Laboratories (Commission) was convened for its final meeting at 1:00 PM on October 23, 2015. Commission Co-Chair TJ Glauthier led the meeting. The meeting included a summary of public comments received to date, an opportunity for additional public comment, and Commission discussion and vote to approve the Final Report.

Opening of Public Meeting

Co-Chair TJ Glauthier opened the meeting and welcomed the commissioners and other participants on the call.

Overview of Commission Draft Report Status

Co-Chair TJ Glauthier expressed gratitude for the input received from everyone throughout the process. He thanked the public for submitting written comments and noted additional clarifications were made to the draft Final Report based on questions and comments received. He noted that after receiving additional oral comments today, the Commission would vote on the draft Final Report. The Final Report is expected to be released on Wednesday, October 28 at a Hearing of the US Senate Appropriations Subcommittee on Energy and Water Development.

<u>Summary of Public Comments Received Prior to September 25th</u>

Susannah Howieson discussed the receipt of 25 comments from the National Laboratories, M&O Contractors, AFGE, DOE, and other public officials. Many comments led to additional clarifications to the draft Final Report. Comments received on the recommendations regarding the structure of NETL's R&D

structure and status as a Government Owned Government Operated (GOGO) Lab emphasized the value of NETL and opposed separation of NETL's R&D functions from its program responsibilities. The Commission chose to preserve its recommendation regarding NETL. Clarifications made to the report included changing the characterization of the "broken trust" between the Department and the Labs to make it clear that it is not even across the Labs; and distinguishing the Lab from the M&O contractor. Comments received regarding the annual operating plan also led to greater clarification of the suggested scope and goal for such a plan in the draft Final Report.

Opportunity for Additional Public Comments

A public comment period followed the summary of changes to the draft Final Report. The first comments came from Ms. Marylia Kelley, Director of Tri-Valley CAREs. She expressed disappointment that the Commission did not recommend removing nuclear programming from Lawrence Livermore National Lab and restructuring the lab under the Office of Science. She requested that a paragraph be added to the Final Report indicating that the topic of laboratory consolidation was not examined by the Commission. Ms. Kelley noted a correlation between increased transactional oversight and increased safety and expressed concern that decreased transactional oversight could degrade safety measures over time. Ms. Kelley also requested a more robust recommendation regarding additional funding for environmental management and the demolition and destruction of excess facilities.

The second set of comments came from Mr. Dan Doyle, President of the Local 1995 American Federation of Government Employees. Mr. Doyle's comments centered on the Commission's recommendations regarding the structure of NETL's R&D component and contract structure. He asked the Commission to consider the negative impacts, costs, and other impediments and barriers to implementing changes.

Final comments came from Chris Bowman, Legislative Assistant to US Congressman Mike Doyle. Mr. Bowman stressed the value of NETL and indicated that Congressman Mike Doyle will remain engaged on NETL issues.

Commission Discussion and Vote to Approve Final Report

Co-Chair TJ Glauthier reviewed and addressed the additional oral comments noting that the visits to all 17 National Energy Laboratories informed their opinion regarding the need for peer review in the nuclear work of the weapons labs. He stated the need for proper balance between flexibility and accountability regarding transactional oversite. He also explained the Commission's thoughts regarding the benefits that could be gained from reorganizing the R&D component of NETL to bring more focus to the R&D, and suggested that the potential change to a GOCO model should be discussed and carefully examined with various stakeholders.

The Report was unanimously approved.

The meeting adjourned at 1:35 PM.

Respectfully Submitted:

Karen Gibson, Designated Federal Officer

I hereby certify that these minutes of the October 23, 2015 Lab Commission meeting are true and correct to the best of my knowledge.

TJ Glauthier

Jared Cohon Co-Chair Co-Chair